

New Data

**PHL 320
Critical Thinking
Distance Delivery
Lecture Ten**

Quiz Review

- **Recipe**
 - **Schematize**
 - **Rival explanations**
 - **Rank order (the original and rivals)**
 - **Final assessment (based on, and justified by, what is in first place on the ranking)**

Schematize Argument

- e₁. Study from early 1990s showed about 15% of teens showed hearing loss.
- e₂. Study from mid 2000s showed about 15% of teens showed hearing loss.
- e₃. Most of the hearing loss was in one ear only
- e₄. Better medical care for ear infections.
- e₅. Researchers did not single out personal listening devices for the growing problem.
- e₆. Teenagers, when asked about noise exposure - on the job, from firearms or recreational activities, - didn't indicate any change.
- =====
- t₀. iPod (and other MP3 players) listening is causing hearing loss

Further Testing

- **Cultural comparison**
- **Controlled experiment**
- **Further physiological examination**
- **New data**
 - **A new argument**
 - **Possibly a new rank order**
- **Hypothesis best supported by the (new) evidence may change**

Additional Data

- e₁. Study from early 1990s showed about 15% of teens showed hearing loss.
 - e₂. Study from mid 2000s showed about 15% of teens showed hearing loss.
 - e₃. Most of the hearing loss was in one ear only
 - e₄. Better medical care for ear infections.
 - e₅. Researchers did not single out personal listening devices for the growing problem.
 - e₆. Teenagers, when asked about noise exposure - on the job, from firearms or recreational activities, - didn't indicate any change.
 - e₇. **Studies from third world cultures show similar patterns.**
- =====
- t₀. iPod listening is **not** causing hearing loss.

New Data

- **Two arguments – two assessments of evidence**
- **Both might provide good evidence even though they support contradictory conclusions!**
- **Evidence evaluation is static**
- **Investigation is dynamic**

A Murder

- e₁. Uncle Henry found dead of gun shot.
- e₂. Nephew Rodney stood to inherit.
- e₃. Several witnesses overheard loud argument between Henry and Rodney.
- e₄. Rodney's car was observed outside the home at the time of the shooting.
- e₅. Murder weapon was registered to Rodney.
- e₆. His finger prints were on the gun.

=====

t₀. Rodney murdered Henry.

- **Assess the quality of the evidence using inference to the best explanation**

New Data

- e₁. Uncle Henry found dead of gun shot.
- e₂. Nephew Rodney stood to inherit.
- e₃. Several witnesses overheard loud argument between Henry and Rodney.
- e₄. Rodney's car was observed outside the home at the time of the shooting.
- e₅. Murder weapon was registered to Rodney.
- e₆. His finger prints were on the gun.

=====

t₀. Rodney murdered Henry.

- **e₇. Six witness say that Rodney was playing poker with them all night long**
- **Reassess the evidence now**